A+P Lite How to Keep CGNs from Breaking the Internet

2010.03.02 / Kuala Lampur

Randy Bush <randy@psg.com> Olaf Maennel <olaf@maennel.net>

Problem Statement

Broadband (cable/DSL) and wireless (GSM/3G) providers will not have enough IPv4 space to give a unique IPv4 address to each CPE or terminal so that every consumer has usable IPv4 connectivity.

Large-Scale NAT (LSN)

- LSN (formerly CGN) are NATs in the core of the provider's network
- NATs did not scale to Carrier Grade, no big surprise
- Customer Premises Equipment (CPE) has 4to4 NAT and the core re-NATs 4to4, "double nat" == double trouble.

LSN Breaks the Net

- This cause problems for the carrier, but also for the whole internet, as these captive customers can not use new protocols
- NAT in middle of net has all of the problems of a smart core, the Telco model
- Walled gardens here we go!

I Googled "Walled Garden"



Walled Garden



C = The Global Internet E.g. My Customers A: Isolated, exploited, & restricted

B: Owner here makes money

C: Everyone here can go fsck themselves

Captive Users

- This is the business model of User as Consumer
- Internet becomes Television
- Media is Controlled (DRM)
- Protocol innovation Stops
- RFC 1918 is totally deployed
- Google ads & Amazon frames will not all display!

This Does Not Have to Happen

2010.03.02 APRICOT A+P

Keep the Power of Choice in the Hands of the Users!

Allow the NAT to be "flexible"

A+P in One Slide

- Goal: mechanism required that customer can control their "fate".
- "Steal" bits from Ports and use it for addressing. Same as LSN.
- But do it at the User CPE!
- Thus, extend end-to-end connectivity (at least for some ports) to end-user!





A+P With DS-Lite



- "A+P pkts" are encapsulated in IPv6
- Could use other encapsulation

A+P-NAT at CPE



- Un-NATted end-to-end to CPE
- CPE NATs to connect to IPv4hosts
- APR encap/decaps only (LSN bypassed)!



DS-Lite NAT at LSN





Same Port-Count Issues as LSN

- Trade-off between port efficiency and signaling
- Measurement studies show port-use per residential customer ~100, peaking at ~700
- We are out of addresses, so we share and this is the consequence. No magic

Separable Functions

- Encaps / Decaps
 - "Softwire" (transport pkts from/to CPE)
 - End-user has control over some untranslated ports end-to-end
- NAT
 - Inevitable to connect legacy devices
 - But: flexible of where NATing is done

Status Router vendors are currently prototyping this functionality so that we can learn more through actual deployment exercises vs specification by committee

Open Questions

- Signaling mechanisms
- Port restrictions & agility
- Assigned ports and IPv4 address
- Tunnel address of LSN